Experiments on the control of esca by Trichoderma

STEFANO DI MARCO¹, FABIO OSTI¹ and Augusto Cesari²

¹Istituto di Biometeorologia, Sez. di Bologna, CNR, Via Gobetti 101, 40129 Bologna, Italy ²Dipartimento di Protezione e Valorizzazione Agroalimentare, Università, Via Filippo Re 8, 40126 Bologna, Italy

Summary. Trichoderma harzianum T39 (Trichodex[®]) and T. longibrachiatum strain 6 were applied on grapevine to determine their effectiveness against Phaeomoniella chlamydospora on vine cuttings and pruning wounds. Cuttings were dipped in a Trichoderma suspension either before or after callusing. Pre-callusing dips were carried out for 3 years and yielded contradictory results. By contrast, post-callusing Trichoderma dips led to significant growth of hairy roots and a reduction in the longitudinal discolorations caused by P. chlamydospora inoculated into the root-stock after dipping. Trichoderma spp. were also applied to pruning wounds of grafted potted vines, which were then inoculated by placing drops of a conidial suspension of P. chlamydospora on the wound surface. Trichoderma application here prevented black goo and necrosis in the wood below the wound. In the vineyard, T. harzianum T39 was sprayed after pruning for two consecutive years. The biocontrol agent was reisolated from the wood close to the sprayed pruning wounds for up to 2 months after spraying. Although further investigations are necessary, our findings suggest that Trichoderma could be one of the steps in the control of esca.

Key words: grapevine, biocontrol, Phaeomoniella chlamydospora, nursery, pruning wounds protection.

Introduction

Although all the causes and epidemiological factors of esca are not yet fully understood, recent studies have made clear that *Phaeomoniella chlamydospora* and/or *Phaeoacremonium* species are very likely to be involved in infecting young vines with esca in the nursery or in causing Petri disease (Edwards *et al.*, 2001; Gatica *et al.*, 2001; Surico, 2001; Zanzotto *et al.*, 2001). In the light of these findings, the search for control methods should focus on strategies for disease prevention and/or disease severity reduction (Di Marco *et al.*, 2000).

Attempts to control esca with several chemicals have shown that complete prevention of esca is very

difficult and that the outright eradication of esca fungi once they have colonized a vine plant is impossible (Mugnai *et al.*, 1999; Di Marco *et al.*, 2000). A more promising approach therefore seems to be to make vines more resistant to esca by using chemicals (e.g. fosetyl Al), or to apply biological control agents in the nursery and/or on young established vines (Di Marco *et al.*, 1999; Di Marco *et al.*, 2002; Mazzullo *et al.*, 2000; Fourie *et al.*, 2001).

Species of the genus *Trichoderma* have become the most widely investigated of all potential mycofungicides that may represent an alternative to chemical control. Although their mode of action is not fully understood, they seem to be associated with mycoparasitism, the production of inhibitory compounds, competition for nutrients and space with pathogenic fungi, stimulation of plant growth and enhanced host resistance (Calderon *et al.*, 1993; Haram *et al.*, 1996; Zimand *et al.*, 1996; De Meyer

Corresponding author: S. Di Marco

Fax: +39 051 6398053

E-mail: s.dimarco@ibimet.cnr.it

et al., 1998; Elad et al., 1998; Harman, 2000; Woo et al., 2002). In a study on the control of esca, Di Marco et al. (2002) found that 22 strains of Trichoderma were active in vitro against P. chlamydospora. Some strains completely inhibited this fungus. Hunt et al. (2001) reported that Trichoderma harzianum exhibited various degrees of lytic action towards isolates of grapevine pathogens including P. chlamydospora. These authors also provided evidence suggesting that *Trichoderma* spp. protected pruning wounds against infection. Finally, Fourie et al. (2001) demonstrated that nursery applications of some strains of T. harzianum improved plant and total root mass development. That study suggested that Trichoderma treatments could lead to the development of stronger vines with lower rates of esca.

The present study was undertaken to determine whether applications of *Trichoderma* spp. on grapevines in the nursery carried out either before or after callusing would have beneficial effects on the plant and would be effective against *P. chlamydospora*, the fungus primarily involved, alone or with *Fomitiporia punctata*, in causing esca. Whether *Trichoderma* colonized pruning wounds in the vineyard when it was applied after pruning was also examined. Finally, *Trichoderma* was applied to pruning wounds on potted vines artificially inoculated with *P. chlamydospora*.

Materials and methods

Nursery treatment

Trials were carried out in a commercial nursery at Brisighella, in Emilia Romagna, north-central Italy. All plant material used (various scion/ rootstock combinations as indicated below) was provided by the nursery.

Pre-callusing application

Trials were carried out in 2001–2003 on about 3600 grafted cuttings of different cv./rootstock combinations each year: 'Trebbiano'/SO4 in 2001, 'Sangiovese'/SO4 in 2002, and 'Lambrusco maestri'/ Kober in 2003.

The scions and rootstocks were grafted following the routine nursery procedures. The graft union was then sealed with wax without fungicide, and the grafted cuttings were immersed for 30 min in a *Trichoderma* suspension (*T. harzianum* T39, Trichodex[®], 10^9 cfu g⁻¹) at 400 g hl⁻¹, stirring the suspension in order to avoid the deposit sinking to the bottom of the container. Control grafted cuttings were immersed in water. Cuttings were then stacked with sawdust in separate callusing boxes, each containing approximately 900 vines, and stored at $10-20^{\circ}$ C for 3 weeks. Two boxes per treatment were set up.

At the end of this period, the cuttings were grouped in three classes according to grafting callus formation: i) excellent: callus completely surrounding the trunk, ii) normal: callus partly surrounding the trunk, or iii) failed: non-callused cuttings to be discarded.

For each treatment, results were expressed as the mean percentage of excellent, normal and failed cuttings. Data were subjected to Chi-Square statistical analysis ($P \le 0.05$) using SAS version 8.1 (SAS, 1990).

Post-callusing Trichoderma *application* and P. chlamydospora *inoculation*

Sixty grafted cuttings cv. Trebbiano (rootstock SO4) stored in callusing boxes prior to planting were used in these tests. The bottom ends (2–3 cm) of the cuttings were placed for 30 min in PVC containers with suspensions of Trichoderma: Trichodex[®] at 400 g hl⁻¹, or *T. longibrachiatum* strain 6 at 1.8×10⁶ cfu ml⁻¹ (collection of DIPROVAL, University of Bologna, Italy). Control grafted cuttings were dipped in water. Treated cuttings were planted in plastic pots (20 cm diameter) containing a 30% commercial planting mixture of non-decomposed sphagnum peat (Floragard GmbH, Oldenburg, Germany) and 70% soil collected from the nursery. Potted vines were grown outside in an open frame, watered and pruned to prevent excessive shoot growth, never fertilized or treated for pests or disease. Fifteen vines per treatment were set up.

Sixty days after treatment, vines were inoculated with *P. chlamydospora* by inserting a plug (4 mm diameter) from a two-week-old potato dextrose agar (PDA) culture into a hole made with a hand drill in the rootstock 20–25 cm from the ground. The site of inoculation was covered with Parafilm M (American National Can, Chicago, IL, USA). A sterile PDA plug was used to evaluate the reaction of vine to wounding. Ten vines per treatment were set up.

Fifteen months after the treatment, plants were uprooted, and roots and *P. chlamydospora* development was assessed. The root diameter of each plant was measured with a caliper. Roots were collected and grouped into 3 categories: hairy roots (<0.05 mm diameter); secondary roots (0.05–0.2 mm); primary roots (> 0.2 mm). For each category, the projected root area was measured by video image analysis (Richner *et al.*, 2000). Image acquisition was with a CCD camera (model TK-880, JVC, Yokohama, Japan) interfaced with a computer by an ELVIS board and Chameleon software (Sky Instruments Ltd., Llandrindod Wells, Powys, Wales, UK).

The images of roots were set in a digitalized form consisting of a three-dimensional matrix. Two dimensions of the matrix corresponded to the width and length of the image in pixels, and the third represented the colour value assigned to each pixel. Subsequently, each image was binarized to create a picture in which all pixels had only two possible values, black or white. The threshold was the gray value (150 pixels) setting the dividing line between the pixels turned to white and those turned to black.

For each treatment, data were expressed as the percentage of the primary, secondary and hairy roots in the projected root area (cm^2) .

Phaeomoniella chlamydospora development in the vine wood was assessed in longitudinally split vine trunks. The length of the internal necrotic streaks was measured. Data were expressed as the average length of the internal streaks and subjected to statistical analysis using Duncan's multiple range test, at P=0.05.

Further *in vitro* investigations were performed in order to assess the viability of the pathogen isolated from the inoculated plants.

Pruning wound application

Greenhouse trials

One pruning wound per plant was made on twoyear-old grafted potted vines cv. Montuni (rootstock SO4). The wounds were immediately sprayed with *T. harzianum* (Trichodex, 400 g hl⁻¹) or *T. longibrachiatum* strain 6 (1.8×10^6 cfu ml⁻¹) suspension (10 plants per treatment). Twenty-four hours after spraying, the wounds were inoculated by placing drops of a *P. chlamydospora* conidial suspension (1.7×10^7 conidia ml⁻¹) on the wound surface. Control vines were treated with sterile water. Vines were grown in a non-climatized greenhouse and watered at regular intervals. Twelve months after spraying, the pruned shoots were cut transversely into approx. 3-mm-thick disks. The first disk, which had received the spray directly, was discarded, and the following three were examined under a stereomicroscope, to determine the percentage of vessels showing tyloses or black goo (a tar-like sap in the xylem vessels) on their surface (Morton, 2000). Fungal isolations were made by placing wood fragments from each disk (3–4 fragments per disc) onto PDA + 300 mg l⁻¹ streptomycin sulphate.

Vineyard trials

Two-year trials were performed in two vineyards, one with cv. Riesling and one with cv. Sauvignon. In order to reduce the susceptibility of wounds to infection (Larignon, 1998), pruning was delayed as much as possible (till end of winter) and was immediately followed by Trichoderma (Trichodex 400 g hl⁻¹) spraying. In 2001, the biocontrol agent was mixed with an emulsified pine resin (Vapor Gard[®] 100 ml hl⁻¹) to improve adhesion. Spraying was done on 8 rows, each with about 75 vines. At 7, 15, 30 and 60 days after spraying in 2001, and at 5, 30 and 60 days in 2002, approximately 30 samples of wood close to pruning wounds were collected from sprayed and control vines. The samples had an area of about 1 cm² each and were placed in a selective substrate containing 1.2% potato dextrose broth, 1.5% agar, 50 mg l⁻¹ Rosebengale, and 300 mg l⁻¹ streptomycin sulphate, to assess the viability of the Trichoderma. At each survey date, the percentage of wood samples yielding Trichoderma spp. was determined.

Results

Nursery treatment

Pre-callusing application

Trichoderma applications on graft calli gave different results in the 3 years of the trial (Table 1). In 2001, the distribution of cuttings over the three classes differed significantly, with a greater number of excellent and failed cuttings in treated plants than in untreated plants. In 2002 treated and untreated plants differed slightly but significantly only in the "failed cuttings" category (24% treated vs. 20% untreated). In 2003 there were no significant differences between treated and untreated cuttings in any class of cuttings. Post-callusing application and P. chlamydospora inoculation

Cuttings treated with *T. harzianum* T39 or *T. longibrachiatum* 6 developed significantly more hairy roots than did the untreated plants (Fig. 1), while there were no differences in the development of primary and secondary roots (Fig. 2).

The effects of Trichoderma post-callusing treat-

ment on *P. chlamydospora* infection are summarized in Table 2. Necrotic streaks caused by the pathogen 15 months after inoculation were significantly longer in the *P. chlamydospora*-only control (10.3 cm) than in the *Trichoderma*-treated vine trunks. Streaks length was significantly reduced both with Trichodex (2.1 cm) and with *T. longibrachiatum* 6 (3.4 cm).

Table 1. Effect of the pre-callusing application of <i>Trichoderma harzianum</i> T39 (Trichodex) of

Year	Treatment	Number of cuttings per graft callus			Chi aman Da
		Excellent	Normal	Failed	Cni–square
2001	T. harzianum Untreated	$1137\\44$	99 1385	578 392	< 0.0001
2002	T. harzianum Untreated	$\begin{array}{c} 71 \\ 60 \end{array}$	1299 1370	$\begin{array}{c} 431\\ 355\end{array}$	0.0064
2003	T. harzianum Untreated	91 70	$\begin{array}{c} 1330\\ 1370\end{array}$	390 345	0.0524

 a For each year, distribution of cuttings into classes differs statistically according to Chi–Square test ($P \leq 0.05$).



Fig. 1. Grapevine cuttings treated with *T. harzianum* T39 (Trichodex) (right) by dipping the bottom end (2–3cm) for half an hour in a spore suspension (400 g hl⁻¹) before rooting. Control cuttings (left) were dipped in water. Extent of rooting was assessed 15 months after treatment.

Table 2. Effect of post-callusing application of *Trichoder*ma on *Phaeomoniella chlamydospora* inoculated in the grapevine trunk 60 days after *Trichoderma* treatment.

Treatment	Average length of internal necrosis (cm)		
T. harzianum T39 (Trichodex)	2.1 c ^a		
T. longibrachiatum 6	3.4 b		
P. chlamydospora control	10.3 a		
Sterile control	1.2 c		

 $^{\rm a}$ Values in column followed by the same letter do not differ significantly according to Duncan's Multiple Range Test (P =0.05).

Trichoderma did not however completely stop the development of *P. chlamydospora*, which was still reisolated from the necrotic tissue of inoculated vines.

Trichoderma sprays on pruning wound

Greenhouse trials

Isolations from the vine-shoot sections of vines yielded a range of fungi: *Alternaria*, *Penicillium*, *Epicoccum*, *Botryosphaeria*, and *Fusarium*. No clear evidence of *P. chlamydospora* growing out of inoculated tissue was obtained. However, *Trichoderma* was isolated from samples of sprayed vines.

Phaeomoniella chlamydospora-inoculated, unsprayed vines, clearly showed black goo in the vessels (54%) and, in some cases, necrosis of the parenchyma. By contrast, *Trichoderma*-sprayed plants never showed necroses or black goo, although tyloses-like formation was found in 10-12%of the vessels (Table 3).

Vineyard trials

Trichoderma sprayed on fresh pruning wounds in the field remained persistent and viable for up to 60 days. Over a period of 8 weeks after spraying, recovery of *Trichoderma* gradually decreased. The addition of pine resin had no effect on the biocontrol agent (Fig. 3).

Discussion

Over the last few years, *Trichoderma* treatment to control fungi associated with esca have been tested at the nursery and on pruning wounds (Messina, 1999; Fourie *et al.*, 2001; Hunt *et al.*, 2001; Di Marco *et al.*, 2002).

Messina (1999) reported that *Trichoderma* treatments in callusing boxes produced a stronger graft union and a shorter callusing period. Our trials gave conflicting results. There was clear beneficial effect on the graft union only in the first year. This variability of *Trichoderma* activity may reflect the complex set of interactions between the biocontrol agent and the host-plant. At the end of the callusing period, *Trichoderma* treatment generally led to the production of both more failed cuttings and more excellent cuttings than were produced in untreated plants, possibly due to a kind of selective effect during the grafting process.

As regards the effect of *Trichoderma* on vine rooting, Fourie *et al.* (2001) found that the fresh root mass of grapevines increased by 41.7% after monthly *Trichoderma* treatments to the soil in the nursery. In our experiment, hairy root development was four times as great in cuttings dipped in *Trichoderma* at the bottom end soon after graft callusing as in cuttings not so treated. Although no differences in vegetative growth between these plants were visually noted, vines probably benefited from a more developed hairy root system, which improved water and nutrient uptake and increased tolerance to stress-related diseases

Treatment	Necrosis	Black streaking (%)	Tyloses-like formation (%)
T. longibrachiatum 6 + P. chlamydospora	No	0	10
T. harzianum T39 + P. chlamydospora	No	0	12
T. longibrachiatum 6	No	0	0
T. harzianum T39	No	0	0
P. chlamydospora control	Yes	54	0
Wound control	No	0	0

Table 3. Effect of Trichoderma on pruning wounds in potted vines inoculated with Phaeomoniella chlamydospora.



Fig. 2. Effect of post-callusing application of *Trichoderma* on the development of the root system. Bars represent standard deviation.

(Harman, 2000; Fourie et al., 2001). According to this hypothesis, our data demonstrate, for the first time to our knowledge, that post-callusing treatment with Trichoderma significantly reduces necrosis length caused by P. chlamydospora inoculated into the rootstock after the biocontrol agent. Since Trichoderma was applied far from the site of inoculation, the most likely explanation for this improved control of P. chlamydospora is that it resulted from a stronger plant defense reaction. Among studies on the defense reactions induced by Trichoderma, De Meyer et al. (1998) also reported that T. harzianum T39 was active against *Botrytis cinerea*, even when the antagonist was applied to plant parts that were spatially remote from the site of B. cinerea inoculation; they postulated the induction of systemic resistance.

Hunt *et al.* (2001) suggested that *Trichoderma* was potentially a strong agent protecting pruning wounds against infection from fungi involved in grapevine trunk disease and vine decline. Moreover, these authors were still able to isolate the biocontrol agent from infected samples 8 months af-

ter it had been applied on pruning wounds under controlled conditions. In the vineyard test of our study, *Trichoderma* sprayed on pruning wounds was recovered 60 days after spraying. The test could not be extended beyond this period because of the development of the canopy.

Initial attempts to control esca in the vineyard using Trichoderma were not very effective, probably because spraying was done on apparently healthy vines that were already affected with esca (Bisiach et al., 1996; Mugnai et al., 1999; Di Marco et al., 2000). Later results showed that pre-infection Trichoderma sprays on fresh pruning wounds prevented black goo and limited the effect of artificial infection of *P. chlamydospora* to a moderate Tyloses-like formation. This substantial degree of protection was achieved merely by spraying small pruning wounds in young vines. The results of this study therefore provide further evidence that Trichoderma is effective as a preventive agent used on vines that are not yet infected (Di Marco et al., 2000).

Numerous factors are involved in the complex interaction between *Trichoderma*, the vine and the

pathogen. An understanding of the mode of action and effectiveness of the biocontrol agent is needed to design an application protocol that is optimally suited for different nursery practices, or to use it as a protectant of pruning wounds. For this reason, further studies are needed to improve the biocontrol of *Trichoderma* and move towards its practical implementation.



Fig. 3. Isolation of *Trichoderma* from wood samples of grapevine cv. Riesling (top) and Sauvignon (bottom) collected at different times after treatment with Trichodex[®]. Data represent the percentage of fertile fragments.

Acknowledgements

The authors thank the nursery Dalmonte Guido e Vittorio for much help given during this study. This research was partially supported by a grant from CRPV, Centro Ricerche Produzioni Vegetali, Diegaro di Cesena (FC), Italy.

Literature cited

- Bisiach M., G. Minervini and S. Di Marco, 1996. Attualità nella difesa contro il mal dell'esca della vite. In: Convegno nazionale "Arsenico, si-no", 14 dicembre 1995, Forum fitoiatrici Ersa, Codroipo, Udine, Italy, 123–135.
- Calderon A.A., J.M. Zapata, R. Muñoz, M.A. Pedreño and A.R. Barcelo, 1993. Resveratrol production as a part of hypersensitive-like response of grapevine cells to an elicitor from *Trichoderma viride*. New Phytologist 124, 455–463.
- De Meyer G., J. Bigirimana, Y. Elad and M. Höfte, 1998. Induced systemic resistance in *Trichoderma harzianum* T39 biocontrol of *Botrytis cinerea*. *European Journal of Plant Pathology* 104, 279–286.
- Di Marco S., A. Mazzullo, F. Calzarano and A. Cesari, 1999. In vitro studies on the phosphorous acid-vitis stilbenes interaction, and in vivo phosetyl Al activity towards *Phaeoacremonium* spp. grapevine wood decay agents. In: Modern Fungicides and Antifungal Compounds II (H. Lyr, P.E. Russel, H.W. Dehene, H.D. Sisler ed.), Intercept Ltd, Handover, Hampshire, UK, 171–177.
- Di Marco S., A. Mazzullo, F. Calzarano and A. Cesari, 2000. The control of esca: status and perspectives. *Phytopathologia Mediterranea* 39(1), 232–240.
- Di Marco S., F. Osti, R. Roberti, F. Calzarano and A. Cesari, 2002. Attività di specie di *Trichoderma* nei confronti di *Phaeomoniella chlamydospora*, patogeno associato al mal dell'esca della vite. *Atti Giornate Fitopatologiche* 2, 419–424.
- Edwards J., G. Marchi and I.G. Pascoe, 2001. Young esca in Australia. *Phytopathologia Mediterranea* 40, 303– 310.
- Elad Y., D. Rav David, T. Levi, A. Kapat, B. Kirshner, E. Guvrin and A. Levine, 1998. *Trichoderma harzianum* T39 mechanisms of biocontrol of foliar pathogens. In: *Modern Fungicides and Antifungal Compounds II* (H. Lyr, P.E. Russell, H.-W. Dehne and H.D. Sisler, ed.), Intercept Ltd, Handover, Hampshire, UK, 459–467.
- Fourie P.H., F. Hallen, J. van der Vyver and W. Schreuder, 2001. Effect of *Trichoderma* treatments on the occurrence of decline pathogens in the roots and rootstocks of nursery grapevines. *Phytopathologia Mediterranea* 40, 473–478.

Gatica M., C. Césari, S. Magnin and J. Dupont, 2001. Phaeo-

acremonium species and *Phaeomoniella chlamydospora* in vines showing "hoja de malvon" and young vine decline symptoms in Argentina. *Phytopathologia Mediterranea* 40, 317–324.

- Haram S., H. Schickler, A. Oppenheim and I. Chet, 1996. Differential expression of *Trichoderma harzianum* chitinases during mycoparasitism. *Phytopathology* 86, 980–985.
- Harman G.E., 2000. Myths and dogmas of biocontrol: changes in perceptions derived from research on *Trichoder*ma harzianum T-22. Plant Disease 84, 377–393.
- Hunt J.S., D.S.J. Gale and I.C. Harvey, 2001. Evaluation of *Trichoderma* as bio-control for protection against wood-invading fungi implicated in grapevine trunk diseases. *Phytopathologia Mediterranea* 40, 485–486.
- Larignon P., 1998. Esca disease from a European perspective. In: Seminar and Workshop on Black Goo Symptoms and Occurrence of Grape Declines – IAS/ICGTD Proceedings 1998 (L. Morton ed.), International Ampelography Society, Fort Valley, VA, USA, 43–55.
- Mazzullo A., S. Di Marco, F. Osti and A. Cesari, 2000. Bioassays on the activity of resveratrol, pterostilbene and phosphorous acid towards fungi associated with esca of grapevine. *Phytopathologia Mediterranea* 39, 357–365.
- Messina J., 1999. The use of beneficial Trichoderma in grapevine propagation. Proceedings of the 1999 Conference of the Australian Region of the International Plant Propagator's Society 48, 145–148.
- Morton L., 2000. Viticulture and grapevine declines: lessons of black goo. *Phytopathologia Mediterranea* 39, 59–67.
- Mugnai L., A. Graniti and G. Surico, 1999. Esca (black measles) and brown wood-streaking: two old and elusive diseases of grapevine. *Plant Disease* 83, 404–418.
- Richner W., M. Liedgens, H. Bürgi, A. Soldati and P. Stamp, 2000. Root image analysis and interpretation. In: *Root Methods*, a Handbook (A.L. Smit, A.G. Bengough, C. Engels, M. van Noordwijk, S. Pellerin, S.C. van de Geijn, ed.), Springer Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 306–341.
- SAS, 1990. SAS/STAT User's Guide, Categorical Data Analysis. SAS Institute Inc., Cary, NC, USA, 499 pp.
- Surico G., 2001. Towards commonly agreed answers to some basic questions of esca. *Phytopathologia Mediterranea* 40, 487–491.
- Woo S.L., M. Ruocco, S. Lanzuise, V. Scala, F. Vinale, F. Scala and M. Lorito, 2002. Genetic improvement of antagonistic fungi and their ability to induce systemic disease resistance in the plant. *Journal of Plant Patholo*gy 84, 199.
- Zanzotto A., S. Serra, W. Viel and M. Borgo, 2001. Investigation into the occurrence of esca-associated fungi in cuttings and bench-grafted vines. *Phytopathologia Mediterranea* 40, 311–316.
- Zimand G.,Y. Elad and I. Chet, 1996. Effect of Trichoderma harzianum on Botrytis cinerea pathogenicity. Phytopathology 86, 1255–1260.

Accepted for publication: January 3, 2003