Phytopathologia Mediterranea

The international journal of the Mediterranean Phytopathological Union



Citation: A. Chalbi, B. Sghaier-Hammami, G. Meca, J.M. Quiles, C. Abdelly, C. Marangi, A.F. Logrieco, A. Moretti, M. Masiello (2020) Characterization of mycotoxigenic *Alternaria* species isolated from the Tunisian halophyte *Cakile maritima. Phytopathologia Mediterranea* 59(1): 107-118. doi: 10.14601/Phyto-10720

Accepted: February 7, 2020

Published: April 30, 2020

Copyright: © 2020 A. Chalbi, B. Sghaier-Hammami, G. Meca, J.M. Quiles, C. Abdelly, C. Marangi, A.F. Logrieco, A. Moretti, M. Masiello. This is an open access, peer-reviewed article published by Firenze University Press (http://www.fupress.com/pm) and distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Data Availability Statement: All relevant data are within the paper and its Supporting Information files.

Competing Interests: The Author(s) declare(s) no conflict of interest.

Editor: Laura Mugnai, Università di Firenze, Italy.

Research Paper

Characterization of mycotoxigenic *Alternaria* species isolated from the Tunisian halophyte *Cakile maritima*

Arbia CHALBI^{1,2,3}, Besma SGHAIER-HAMMAMI^{1,*}, Giuseppe MECA⁴, Juan Manuel QUILES⁴, Chedly ABDELLY¹, Carmela MARANGI⁵, Antonio F. LOGRIECO³, Antonio MORETTI³, Mario MASIELLO³

¹ Laboratoire des Plantes Extrêmophiles, Centre de Biotechnologie de Borj-Cédria, BP 901, Hammam-Lif 2050, Tunisia

² Faculty of Sciences of Tunis, University Campus 2092, University of Tunis El Manar, Tunis, Tunisia

³ Institute of Sciences of Food Production, Research National Council (ISPA-CNR), Via G. Amendola 122/O, 70126, Bari, Italy

⁴ Laboratory of Food Toxicology, Department of Preventive Medicine, Nutrition and Food Science Area, Faculty of Pharmacy, University of Valencia Avenida Vicent Andres Estelles s/n, 46100 Burjassot, Valencia, Spain

⁵ Institute for Applied Mathematics "M. Picone", Via G. Amendola 122/D, 70126, Bari, Italy

* Corresponding author: sghaierhammamibesma@gmail.com

Summary. Cakile maritima is a typical halophyte of the Mediterranean coasts. In addition to its ecological and industrial properties, C. maritima has antiscorbutic, diuretic and purgative roles in folk remedies. This plant is infected by different fungal species, mainly belonging to Alternaria genus. Two-hundred Alternaria strains were collected from four different pedo-climatic areas in Tunisia, from C. maritima fresh plant tissues showing symptoms of Alternaria infection. Phylogenetic analyses of 79 representative Alternaria strains, were carried out using multi-locus gene sequencing. All the strains clustered in the Alternaria Section: 47 strains had high homology with A. alternata reference strain, 13 grouped with A. arborescens reference strain, 12 grouped with A. mali reference strain, and seven strains were not well defined with A. mali as their closest species. In vitro production of tenuazonic acid (TA), alternariol (AOH), alternariolmonomethyl ether (AME), and altenuene (ALT) was evaluated. Approx. 68% of strains simultaneously produced AOH, AME and TA. Only two A. alternata and one A. mali strains were ALT producing. Pathogenicity tests on leaves of C. maritima were carried out with 41 representative strains. Alternaria arborescens showed the greatest pathogenicity compared to A. alternata and A. mali, although no statistically significant differences in pathogenicity were observed. This is the first study on Tunisian populations of Alternaria species isolated from the extremophile C. maritima.

Keywords. Alternaria section, Alternaria arborescens, Alternaria mali, Alternaria mycotoxins.

Key contributions. Four clades of *Alternaria* species were identified from the halophyte plant *Cakile* maritima.

Alternaria alternata was the most abundant (60%) and especially in stems and leaves.

A new genetic entity among the *Alternaria* strains studied needs to be further characterized. The majority of *Alternaria* strains (74%) produced the AME mycotoxin.

AME and AOH were the most frequently produced mycotoxins by all the *Alternaria* strains.

Alternaria arborescens strains were the most pathogenic.

INTRODUCTION

Cakile maritima (sea rocket) is an extremophile C3 halophyte (Brassicaceae) which is widely distributed on sandy coasts (Clausing et al., 2000; Kadereit et al., 2005). This plant, together with Xanthium italicum and Eryngium maritimum, is typical coastal vegetation of several regions including the Black Sea coasts, the Mediterranean basin, the Atlantic coasts of North Africa and Europe, and the North Sea and Baltic Sea coasts (Clausing et al., 2000). These plants grow a few meters from shorelines, and are useful barriers defending coastal ecosystems. Sea rocket is an annual succulent plant, growing in geographical areas characterized by high salinity and low soil fertility (Barbour et al., 1970). It is tolerant to abiotic stress conditions such as high salinity, water stress and high temperature, which are all the characteristics of halophyte plants (Debez et al., 2012). Cakile maritima is a good candidate model plant for understanding botanical biochemical and physiological mechanisms.

In Tunisia, *C. maritima*, in addition to its role in ecosystem coastal preservation, is also considered an edible plant, used traditionally as a green vegetable for human and animal consumption. Dried root powder is also mixed with cereal flour to make bread (Zarrouk *et al.*, 2003; Debez *et al.*, 2004). The whole plant, harvested at flowering for its high content of iron, ascorbic acid and iodine, is traditionally used in antiscorbutic, diuretic and purgative folk remedies (Kubiak-Martens *et al.*, 1999).

Spontaneous plants of *C. maritima* are colonized by fungi causing necrotic lesions on above-ground parts. Among fungal species, *Alternaria brassicicola* (Schwein.) Wiltshire (1947) has been often associated to *C. maritima* infections (Thrall *et al.*, 2000), so several studies have been carried out to evaluate this host-pathogen interaction (Thrall *et al.*, 2000; 2002; 2005; Oliver *et al.*, 2001; Bock *et al.*, 2005; Linde *et al.*, 2010).

Alternaria is ubiquitous and abundant in the atmosphere and in soil, seeds, and agricultural commodities. This genus includes plant pathogenic and saprophytic species that may affect crops in the field or can cause harvest and postharvest decay of plant products (Logrieco et al., 2009; Patriarca, 2016; Somma et al., 2019). Alternaria spores have been related to human infections, such as rhinosinusitis, asthma, cutaneous and subcutaneous infections, and oculomycosis (Pastor and Gaurro, 2008; Canova et al., 2013; Hattab et al., 2019). Mycotoxins are major food contaminants affecting global food security, especially in low and middleincome countries (Moretti et al., 2019). Several studies have confirmed the toxic effects of Alternaria metabolites for animals and humans, but these toxins are not regulated by legislation, and acceptable levels in food are not determined. Alternaria mycotoxins are arousing interest worldwide, and the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) has provided scientific opinion on the risks for animal and public health related to the presence of Alternaria toxins in food and feed (Arcella et al., 2016).

Among the secondary metabolites produced by *Alternaria* species, there are both phytotoxins, that can play an important role in the plant pathogenesis processes, and mycotoxins, that can be harmful to humans and animals (Logrieco *et al.*, 2009). Therefore, since *C. maritima* is used in traditional food, consumption of *Alternaria* toxin-contaminated plants can represent a serious toxicological risk for consumers (Wang *et al.*, 1996; Ostry, 2008; Logrieco *et al.*, 2009; Lou *et al.*, 2013).

The dibenzopyrone derivatives alternariol (AOH), alternariolmonomethyl ether (AME) and altenuene (ALT), and the tetramic acid derivative tenuazoic acid (TA), are among the most important mycotoxins produced by *Alternaria* species. Alternariol and AME are usually found in combination, and have teratogenic and fetotoxic effects (Fehr *et al.*, 2009). Genotoxic activity on human colon cancer cell lines has also been observed (Wang *et al.*, 1996; Ostry, 2008; Fehr *et al.*, 2009; Bensassi *et al.*, 2012). A recent study also reported that AOH was an androgen agonist in *in vitro* assay (Stypula-Trebas *et al.*, 2017).

Tenuazonic acid is a well-known mycotoxin and phytotoxin, produced primarily by *A. alternata* (Fr.) Keissl. (1912) and by other phytopathogenic *Alternaria* species, including *A. japonica* Yoshii (1941), detected on wheat in Tunisia (Bensassi *et al.*, 2009), *A. longipes* (Ellis & Everh.) E.W. Mason (1928), *A. radicina* Meier, Drechsler & E.D. Eddy (1922), and *A. tenuissima* (Kunze) Wiltshire (1933). In central and southern Africa, TA has been associated with human hematologic disorder known as "onalay", a thrombocytopenia (Steyn and Rabie, 1976). The presence of these mycotoxins in wheat has also been related to elevated levels of human esophageal cancer in China (Liu *et al.*, 1992).

Morphological identification of Alternaria species is often difficult due to interspecific similarities and intraspecific polymorphisms (Simmons, 1990; Simmons and Roberts, 1993; Roberts et al., 2000; Pryor and Michailides, 2002; Serdani et al., 2002; Belisario et al., 2004; Hong et al., 2006). The high sensitivity of Alternaria to environmental factors may lead to ambiguities if taxonomy is based only on phenotype (Andrew et al., 2009). "Polyphasic" approaches using morphological, molecular and chemical techniques could therefore be useful for characterization of Alternaria species (Andersen et al., 2008; Brun et al., 2013).

Although several studies have focused on the occurrence of *Alternaria* species and *Alternaria* metabolites in food commodities, little knowledge is available on the *Alternaria* species living on extremophile plants. Santiago *et al.* (2018) suggested that *Alternaria* species that colonize extremophile plant environments show great adaptation to survival under extreme conditions, such as high temperature, low water and nutrient availability, osmotic stress, desiccation, and exposure to high levels of UV radiation, so these fungi are interesting examples of fungal diversity.

Based on this lack of knowledge, the aims of the present study were: i) to isolate and estimate the distribution of *Alternaria* species on *C. maritima* growing in different bioclimatic conditions, in Tunisia; ii) to identify *Alternaria* at species level using a polyphasic approach; iii) to analyze the profile of the main mycotoxins produced by the species isolated from *C. maritima*; and iv) to test their pathogenicity on *C. maritima* leaves.

MATERIAL AND METHODS

Origin of the samples

Leaves, stems and seeds of spontaneous *C. maritima* plants, showing typical symptoms of *Alternaria* infections, were collected arbitrarily in Tunisia. Approximately 20 plants were collected per province, and five portions of each plant were used for fungal isolation. A total of 100 *C. maritima* samples were collected per province. Four provinces, from the north to the south of Tunisia and with two pedo-climatic conditions, were considered: Rades and Raouad, characterized by temperate winters and annual rainfall of 200–700 mm (semi-arid regions),

109

and Sfax and Djerba, characterized by temperate winters and annual rainfall of 100–200 mm (arid regions).

Fungus isolation and growth conditions

After surface-disinfestation with 2% sodium hypochlorite solution for 2 min and two washings with sterilized distilled water for 1 min, symptomatic plant tissues were cut into small pieces (5 mm diam.) with a sterilized scalpel and dried on a sterile filter paper in a laminar flow cabinet. Single tissue pieces were then transferred into Petri dishes containing Potato Dextrose Agar (PDA) amended with 0.10 g L⁻¹ streptomycin sulphate salt and 0.05 g L⁻¹ neomycin. The dishes were incubated at $25 \pm 1^{\circ}$ C for 7 d under an alternating light/darkness cycle of 12 h photoperiod. From the 100 samples selected per province, 50 isolates were kept as monoconidium and homogeneous cultures. Two hundred *Alternaria* strains were collected from the four sample sites.

Morphological characterization

Following procedures of Simmons (2007), Alternaria strains were grown on PDA and on Potato Carrot Agar (PCA) to characterize their morphological traits. After 7 d of incubation at $25 \pm 1^{\circ}$ C, under an alternating light/ darkness cycle of 12 h photoperiod, conidium dimensions, colour, septation, conidiophore branching, and dimensions of catenulate conidia were determined using a light microscope (×40 magnification).

Molecular characterization and phylogenetic analysis of Alternaria strains

Based on morphological traits, 79 representative strains were selected for phylogenetic and chemical analyses. Thirty-eight *Alternaria* strains were from the semiarid region (Rades: 21 and Raouad: 17) and 41 were from the arid region (Djerba: 19 and Sfax: 22).

Mycelium of 3-d-old colonies, grown on sterilized cellophane disks overlaid on PDA plates, was collected by scraping and then frozen. Genomic DNA was extracted and purified from powdered lyophilized mycelia (each sample, 10–15 mg) using the Wizard Magnetic DNA Purification System for Food kit (Promega Corporation), according to the manufacture's protocol. Quantity and integrity of DNA were checked at Thermo-Scientific Nanodrop (LabX, Midland, Ontario, Canada), and by comparison with a standard 1 kb DNA Ladder (Fermentas GmbH) on 0.8% agarose gel, after electrophoretic separation. For each *Alternaria* strain, the informative target genes, allergen alt-a1 (*alt-a1*), glyceraldeyde-3-phosphate dehydrogenase (*gpd*) and translation elongation factor 1- α (*tef*), were amplified, respectively, with the following primer pairs: gpd1/gpd2 (Berbee *et al.*, 1999), alt-for/altrev (Hong *et al.*, 2005), and Alt-tef1/Alt-tef2 (Somma *et al.*, 2019), and were sequenced for phylogeny analyses.

The Polymerase Chain Reaction mixture (15 μ L), contained 15 ng of DNA template, 0.45 μ L of each primer (10 mM), 0.3 μ L of dNTPs (10mM) and 0.075 μ L of Hot Master Taq DNA Polymerase (1 U μ L⁻¹; 5 Prime). The three fragment genes were amplified using the PCR conditions of Ramires *et al.* (2018). All PCR products were visualized under UV light after electrophoretic separation in 1× TAE buffer on 1.5% agarose gel.

Each PCR product was purified with the enzymatic mixture Exo/FastAP (Exonuclease I, FastAP thermosensitive alkaline phosphatase, Thermo Scientific) and then sequenced using the Big Dye Terminator Cycle Sequencing Ready Reaction Kit (Applied Biosystems), according to the manufacture's recommendations. Both strands were purified by filtration through Sephadex G-50 (5%) (Sigma-Aldrich) and sequenced in an "ABI PRISM 3730 Genetic Analyzer" (Applied Biosystems). The FASTA sequences were obtained with BioNumerics software (Applied Maths). Phylogenetic trees of single and combined genes, following a multi-locus sequence approach, were generated using the Maximum Likelihood statistical method and bootstrap analyses (1000 replicates, removing gaps) with MEGA5 (Tamura et al., 2011).

Phylogeny analysis was carried out considering the gene sequences of the following reference strains: A. alternata E.G.S.34.016, A. tenuissima E.G.S.34.015, A. arborescens E.G.S.39.128, A. infectoria ex type E.G.S.27.193, A. brassicicola ATCC96836, A. capsici BMP0180, A. carthami BMP1963, A. citriarbusti BMP2343, A. crassa BMP0172, A. fragariae BMP3062, A. gaisen BMP2338, A. limoniasperae BMP2335, A. longipes BMP0313, A. macrospora BMP1949, A. mali BMP3064, A. solani BMP0185, A. tagetica BMP0179, A. tangelonis BMP2327, A. tomotophila BMP2032, and A. turkisafria BMP3436. The gene sequences of these reference strains were downloaded from the National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) and "Alternaria Genomes Database" (AGD). Alternaria infectoria ex type E.G.S.27.193 was used as the outgroup in phylogenetic analyses.

Mycotoxin extraction and chemical profile analyses

Chemical analyses of the 79 Alternaria strains were carried out to evaluate their capabilities to produce

AOH, AME, ALT and TA. Following the methods of Li, *et al.* (2001), all the strains were inoculated onto sterilized rice grain and grown for 21 d at $25 \pm 1^{\circ}$ C in darkness. The cultures were then dried and powdered before mycotoxin extraction.

Mycotoxin analyses were based on the methods of Rubert *et al.* (2012), with modifications. The samples were each finely ground with an Oster Classic grinder (220–240V, 50/60 Hz, 600W). Five grams of each homogenized sample were weighed in a 50 mL capacity plastic tube, and 25 mL of methanol was added. The extraction was carried out using an Ultra Ika T18 basic Ultra-turrax for 3 min. The extract was centrifuged at 4000 rpm for 5 min at 5°C. The supernatant (1 mL) was filtered through a 13 mm × 0.22 µm nylon filter, and diluted before injection into high performance liquid chromatography associated with a diode array detector (LC-DAD). All the extractions were carried out in triplicate.

Alternariol, AME, ALT, and TA were determined using a Merk HPLC with a diode array detector (LC-DAD) L-7455 (Merk), at 256 nm, and Hitachi Software Model D-7000 version 4.0 was used for data analysis. A Gemini C18 column (Phenomenex) 4.6×150 mm and 3 µm particle size was used as the stationary phase. The mobile phase consisted of two eluents, eluent A (water with 50 µL L⁻¹ trifluoroacetic acid), and eluent B (acetonitrile with 50 µL L⁻¹ trifluoroacetic acid). A gradient programme with a constant flow rate of 1 mL min⁻¹ was used, starting with 90% A and 10% B, reaching 50% B after 15 min and 100% B after 20 min which was maintained for 1 min. The gradient was then returned to 10% B for 1 min and allowed to equilibrate for 3 min before the next analysis (Myresiotis et al., 2015). The limit of detection (LOD) for this method was 0.01 mg L⁻¹ and the limit of quantification (LOQ) was 0.1 mg L⁻¹. The data of mycotoxin production were statistically processed using the Prism 5 software (La Jolla; www.graphpad.com).

Pathogenicity tests

A set of 41 representative strains, belonging to all phylogenetic groups previously characterized (Figure 2), were tested for pathogenicity on *C. maritima* leaves. Twenty-four strains of the *A. alternata* group, eight of the *A. arborescens* group, five of the *A. mali* group, and four strains of unknown identity were tested. Seeds were sown into plastic pots (diam, 29 cm; height, 23 cm), filled with inert sand, which were then watered each day with distilled water until germination. The pots were maintained in a greenhouse under controlled conditions of 16 h light/8 h dark cycles, $25 \pm 1^{\circ}$ C and 60% relative humidity. Resulting seedlings were irrigated each day for 2 weeks with the nutrient solution (Hewitt, 1996). 1966). At 6 weeks after sowing, leaves of the plants were cut and placed on glass slides in Petri dishes (one slide per dish) containing a moist filter paper. The leaves were then inoculated with Alternaria conidium suspension (10⁸ conidia mL⁻¹). Control plants were grown in similar condition without fungal inoculation. Separate leaves (six replicates per inoculation treatment) were inoculated. A 10 µL droplet of conidium suspension (10⁸ conidia mL⁻¹; 0.05% Tween 20) was placed in the centre of each leaf. Controls were inoculated by a droplet of sterile distilled water 0.05% Tween 20 solution. The Petri dishes containing leaves were then incubated under laboratory conditions ($25 \pm 3^{\circ}$ C; 12h light/12 h dark photoperiod). Disease progress was evaluated at 7 d post-inoculation (dpi) (Taheri, 2019).

After the incubation period, lesion appearance and external and internal lesion diameters were assessed. The degree of pathogenicity of each inoculated strain was assessed by calculating the diameter of the lesion. Statistical analyses of data were performed using the statistical package Statistix8. A one-way ANOVA was used to test the hypothesis of *Alternaria* species differentiation with respect to the lesion diameter, and means were compared at P < 0.05.

RESULTS

Host symptoms and morphological characterization of Alternaria strains infecting Cakile maritima

Symptomatic plants of *C. maritima* were sampled from two different pedo-climatic conditions (arid and semi-arid). All collected samples (stems, leaves and seeds) showed blight symptoms typical of *Alternaria* infections (Figure 1). Infected plant tissues had necrotic flecks surrounded by chlorotic halos which coalesced into nearly circular or irregularly shaped lesions.

Conidium lengths of *Alternaria* strains ranged from 6 to 29 μ m (greatest average = 17.45 μ m). Conidium widths ranged from 3 to 10 μ m (greatest average = 5.52 μ m) (Supplementary Table S1). The numbers of transverse septa varied from 4 to 11 and longitudinal septa varied from 1 to 3. Different margin types, (smooth and rough surfaces) were observed and the colour of margins varied from brown to dark brown or blackish brown. Different forms of conidia were also observed, including ellipsoidal to long ellipsoidal, subspherical, base conical, rounded or obtuse, and apex rounded.

Based on morphological traits, all the strains were identified has *A. alternata*, *A. arborescens* E.G. Simmons or *A. tenuissima*. However, variations in culture characteristics such as margin types and colony colours were observed.



Figure 1. Symptoms of Alternaria infections on Cakile maritima. Whole plant (a), stem (b), seed (c) and leaves (d).

Molecular and phylogenetic analyses of Alternaria strains

Seventy-nine Alternaria strains were identified by sequencing informative fragments of the *alt-a1*, *gpd* and *tef* genes. All PCR reactions gave amplicons of the expected sizes of approx. 620 nucleotides for *alt-a1*, 510 for *gpd* and 590 for *tef*.

For sequence alignment of the *gpd* gene, a fragment of about 470 nucleotides was analyzed; however, in the *A. brassicicola* (ATCC96836) sequence, beginning at position 104 of the fragment considered, a short deletion of 27 nucleotides was observed. For *tef* and *alta1* sequence alignments, common fragments of about 490 nt (*tef*) and 460 nt (*alt-a1*) were considered. The *tef* gene showed low variability with few polymorphic sites, whereas the *alt-a1* gene showed greater variability among *Alternaria* species.

To further determine the identity of the strains, phylogenetic analysis of the concatenated sequences of the three fragments was carried out. The phylogenetic tree, obtained with Mega5 software using the Maximum Likelihood method, allowed definition of four wellseparated clades, corresponding to Section Alternaria, Section Porri, Section Brassicicola, and Section Infectoriae, as determined using reference strains (Figure 2). The resolution of all the clades was supported by high bootstrap values. Alternaria brassicicola ATCC 96836 and A. infectoria E.G.S.27.193 did not cluster with any Alternaria strains isolated from C. maritima. In the Section Porri, only reference strains were clustered together (Figure 2). All Alternaria strains clustered in Section Alternaria. Forty-seven strains showed homology close to 100% with A. alternata E.G.S. 34.016, A. tenuissima E.G.S.34.015, A. limoniasperae BMP2335, A. turkisafria BMP3436 (Figure 2).

A well-supported group clustered 13 field strains with *A. arborescens* E.G.S.39.128.. However, *A. arborescens* was not detected in Raouad region. There was high variability in this group (Figure 2). In *Alternaria* Section, a sub-clade grouped together 12 *Alternaria* strains showing 100% homology with *A. mali* BMP3064 and *A. citriarbusti* BMP2343A, and seven *Alternaria* strains (ITEM17797, ITEM17798, ITEM17799, ITEM17800, ITEM17801, ITEM17803, ITEM17809), showing 100% of homology among them, all of which were collected in Sfax region.

Based on these data, four phylogenetic Alternaria groups can be discriminated. The A. alternata group was the most frequent (60% of strains), followed by A. arborescens (16%), and A. mali (15%). Seven strains (9%), phylogenetically closely-related to A. mali, were not identified at species level (Figure 2).

Mycotoxin production profiles of Alternaria strains

Data of mycotoxin production are summarized in Table 1 and in Supplementary Table S2. Altenuene was produced by two A. alternata strains (39.2 mg kg⁻¹ by ITEM17789 and 43.1 mg kg⁻¹ by ITEM17855) and one A. mali strain (77.3 mg kg⁻¹ by ITEM17788). The amounts of AME, AOH and TA were very variable. These were: for AOH, from 4.4 mg kg⁻¹ (A. alternata ITEM17782) to 1,856.8 mg kg⁻¹ (A. alternata ITEM17791); for AME, from 53.4 mg kg⁻¹ (A. alternata ITEM17848 to 9,149.4 mg kg⁻¹ (A. mali ITEM17835); and for TA, from 344.4 mg kg⁻¹ (A. mali ITEM17849) to 19,837.3 mg kg⁻¹ (A. alternata ITEM17808). Between the four clades of Alternaria species, qualitative and quantitative differences in mycotoxin production were examined. However, close correlation between phylogenetic clade and mycotoxin production was not detected.

Alternariol mono-methyl ether was produced by 63 of the 79 strains, (production ranges in parentheses): 38 of 47 A. alternata strains (53.4 to 8,766.6 mg kg⁻¹); seven of 13 A. arborescens strains (61.8 to 1,848.7 mg kg⁻¹); ten of 12 A. mali strains (54.0 to 9,149.4 mg kg⁻¹); and all seven Alternaria spp. strains (213 to 1,661.7 mg kg-1). Alternariol was produced by 70 of the 79 stains: 42 of 47 A. alternata strains (4.4 to 1,856.8 mg kg⁻¹); nine 13 A. arborescens strains (9.8 to 514.4 mg kg⁻¹); all 12 A. mali strains (10.8 to 1,671.7 mg kg-1); and all seven Alternaria spp. strains (40.9 to 179.6 mg kg⁻¹). Tenuazonic acid was produced by 64 of the 79 stains: 36 of 47 A. alternata strains (787.4 to 19,837.6 mg kg⁻¹); eight of 13 A. arborescens strains (953 to 6,202mg kg⁻¹); 11 of 12 A. mali strains (344.4 to 6,692.3 mg kg⁻¹); and all 7 Alternaria spp. strains (1.941.6 to 8904.1mg kg⁻¹.

Pathogenicity tests

Symptoms of tissue browning followed by necrosis were observed at 3 and 7 d after inoculation. Necrosis with yellowing occurred at 3 dpi which became more intense at 7 dpi. The control plants did not show disease symptoms (Figure 3).

According to the phylogenetic strain identification, the 24 selected *A. alternata* strains produced a mean lesion diameter of 0.79 cm; the *A. arborescens* strains produced lesions of 0.86 cm mean diameter; the *A. mali* strains gave mean lesion diameter of 0.62 cm; and the *Alternaria* spp. strains produced lesions of 0.88 cm mean diameter. The statistical analyses did not show significant differences in pathogenicity among the different strains used in the tests. Only *A. alternata* and *A. mali* strains gave slight significant differences in mean lesion



10

Figure 2. Phylogenetic tree generated by the Maximum Likelihood method (bootstrap 1,000 replicates) of combined *alt-a1*, *gpd*, and *tef* gene sequences from 79 *Alternaria* strains isolated from *Cakile maritima* in Tunisia. *Alternaria infectoria* E.G.S.27.193 was used as outgroup in tree.

sizes (Supplementary Table S3). A one-way ANOVA was performed using the lesion diameters as a factor to test the pathogenicity of the different species. The sig-

nificance level was set at $\alpha = 0.05$, and the strains were considered as replicates of the species. The probability (*P* = 0.0846) indicated that the species did not exhibit

| | | Mean amount of mycotoxin produced (mg kg ⁻¹) ^a | | | |
|-----------------|--------------------------------|---|--------|---------|------|
| Clade | | AOH | AME | TA | ALT |
| A. alternata | No. of positive/total strains | 41/47 | 38/47 | 36/47 | 2/47 |
| | Frequency (%) | 87.2 | 80.8 | 76.6 | 4.2 |
| | Mean Value | 198.6 | 1632.0 | 3767.5 | 41.1 |
| | Min Value | 4.4 | 53.4 | 787.4 | 39.2 |
| | Max Value | 1856.8 | 8766.6 | 19837.6 | 43.1 |
| A. arborescens | No. of positive/total strains | 9/13 | 7/13 | 8/13 | 0/47 |
| | Frequency (%) | 69.2 | 53.8 | 61.5 | 0 |
| | Mean Value | 130.6 | 814.2 | 2993.5 | - |
| | Min Value | 9.8 | 61.8 | 953.0 | - |
| | Max Value | 514.4 | 1848.7 | 6202.0 | - |
| A. mali | No. of positive/total strains | 12/12 | 10/12 | 11/12 | 1/12 |
| | Frequency (%) | 100 | 83.3 | 91.7 | 8.3 |
| | Mean Value | 331.8 | 2108.7 | 4223.2 | - |
| | Min Value | 10.8 | 54.0 | 344.4 | - |
| | Max Value | 1671.7 | 9149.4 | 6692.3 | - |
| Alternaria spp. | No.r of positive/total strains | 7/7 | 7/7 | 7/7 | 0/7 |
| | Frequency (%) | 100 | 100 | 100 | - |
| | Mean Value | 119.6 | 975.4 | 4631.5 | - |
| | Min Value | 40.9 | 213.0 | 1941.6 | - |
| | Max Value | 179.6 | 1661.7 | 8904.1 | - |

Table 1. Mycotoxin production and mycotoxin incidence for different phylogenetic Alternaria clades. Proportions of strains, and mean amounts of four mycotoxins, are indicated of each clade

^a AOH, Alternariol; AME, Alternariol methyl ether; TA, Tenuazonic Acid; ALT, Altenuene.

a statistically significant difference in mean lesion sizes. However, the distributions of lesion diameters for *A. mali* was separated from those for the other species, as indicated by the box plots in Figure 4. To assess this difference a multiple comparison test was carried out. This was a pairwise comparison of the groups (species) using with different comparison procedures (Least Significative Difference; Bonferroni, Scheffe, Dunn and Sidak; or Fisher's least significant differences method). Only the Least Significant difference between *A. mali* and the other species. For the other comparison methods, the difference between the species were not statistically significant.

DISCUSSION

This study has characterized *Alternaria* species occurring on the halophyte *C. maritima* from different bioclimatic areas in Tunisia. *Alternaria* species are major contaminants and pathogens of a wide range of crops,

causing economic losses for producers, and health risks for consumers due to the accumulation of toxic metabolites (Da Cruz Cabrala *et al.*, 2016).

Morphological characterization of the representative strains Alternaria examined in this study has shown high variability in conidium size, shape, dimensions and septation, confirming that the species identification based on morphological characters is unreliable. Furthermore, there was no correlation between specific morphological traits of the different strains and their bioclimatic region origins. There was also no correlation with the different plant tissues from which the strains were isolated. Similar results were observed by Chethana et al. (2018), who found different morphological traits of Alternaria strains isolated from onion did not depend from their geographical or plant tissue origins. To perform a more discriminating identification at species level, a representative set of the Alternaria strains was investigated by using a polyphasic approach, based also on molecular and chemical characterization.

All the representative strains were phylogenetically identified in Section Alternaria (Lawrence et al., 2013),



Figure 3. Symptoms resulting on *Cakile maritima* leaves 7 d after inoculation with *Alternaria* strains *A. alternata* (ITEM17830; two upper photographs) or *A. mali* (ITEM17842; lower photographs).

which includes the most important mycotoxigenic Alternaria species, and has A. alternata as the type species (Woudemberg et al., 2015). The three genes (gpd, tef, altal) used for multi-locus sequence analyses were selected for their informative responses in Alternaria, as suggested by Somma et al. (2019). All the strains grouped into four phylogenetic clades: 13 strains were identified as A. arborescens, although they showed a great variability; the largest clade included 47 strains, with a high level of homology, and was identified as A. Alternaria; 12 strains were identified as A. mali; and seven strains were grouped in a clade closely related to, but different from, A. mali. These seven strains were not assigned to any species. The different identified Alternaria species could not be related to particular plant tissues and/or bioclimatic conditions. Alternaria alternata and A. mali strains colonize all types of C. maritima tissues, and were isolated from the two climatic regions. The exception was all the strains of the unidentified clade, (Alternaria spp.; Figure 2), which were isolated only from the seeds of C. maritima plants collected in the arid region of Sfax. Also, the A. arborescens strains were not detected in the semi-arid region of Raouad. Similar results were reported by Bensassi et al. (2009; 2011), who identified A. alternata as the most frequent Alternaria species



Figure 4. Boxplots (median (red), upper and lower 25th and 75th percentiles, 95% confidence intervals) of lesion diameters produced on inoculated *Cakile maritima* plants by different *Alternaria* species. The large overlap for *A. alternata, A. arborescens, Alternaria* spp. is obvious.

occurring on wheat growing in all regions of Tunisia sampled, which were characterized by different environmental conditions. Schiro *et al.* (2018) also showed that conidium production of several *Alternaria* spp. on wheat plants was not correlated with specific microclimatic conditions and was uniform in the field in all regions sampled.

Several authors (Andersen et al., 2008; Brun et al., 2013; Somma et al., 2019), have shown that accurate identification of Alternaria spp. requires the polyphasic approach, using morphology, phylogeny, and mycotoxin profiling. Cakile maritima is also often used for human and animal consumption. The parts of the plants used for nutrition could become potential natural sources of Alternaria mycotoxins, if contaminated by Alternaria species. However, since there is still little knowledge of the natural Alternaria mycotoxin contamination in these plants, more investigations are required before conclusions can be drawn on the health risks associated to C. maritima consumption. Capability to produce mycotoxins by representative strains of the Alternaria population isolated in this study has showed that most (90%) of the strains, produced at least one of four assessed mycotoxins, sometimes at very high levels (Supplementary Table S1). This indicated the potential mycotoxicological risk of Alternaria strains isolated from these plants. Only three strains produced ALT, while production AME and AOH by the strains analyzed was proven strictly correlated (Supplementary Table S2). This confirms previous reports (Bensassi et al., 2011; Ramires et al., 2018). Alternaria mycotoxins have been frequently reported as natural contaminants of agri-food crops (Puntscher *et al.*, 2018), and their production under natural conditions has been associated to several factors such as plant species and host cultivar, environmental conditions, cultivation techniques, plant growth stage, time of harvesting, and crop rotation (Lauren and Fadwa, 2008). The dominance of mycotoxigenic *Alternaria* species on *C. maritima*, reported here for the first time, suggests that this plant can potentially be a risk for human and animal health, if contaminated parts of plants are consumed. In addition, *C. maritima* could be a source of inoculum of *Alternaria* species, if the plants grow in the proximity of other important food plants such as wheat.

The pathogenicity tests showed that the levels of aggressiveness of different *Alternaria* strains from *C. maritima* leaves were different among species, with the pathogenicity of *A. mali* being less than for the other species.

The phylogenetic study indicated the occurrence of a set of strains closely-related to *A. mali*, that could represent a new phylogenetic species. This shows that *C. maritima* could be a source of *Alternaria* genetic diversity to be further investigated. This study also confirms that it is still important to provide genetically well-defined reference isolates for taxonomic investigations of *Alternaria*. These should be accurately validated by a standardized common approach in research dealing with *Alternaria* taxonomy (Somma *et al.*, 2019).

CONCLUSION

These results reported here show that the Tunisian halophyte *C. maritima* can be commonly infected by mycotoxigenic *Alternaria* species. Morphological, molecular and mycotoxin analyses confirmed variability within *Alternaria* species of Tunisian origin from different climates. However, no clear links between species with host or geographic origins could be established. This research has shown that *C. maritima* can be a source of *Alternaria* genetic diversity to be further investigated, to provide new information on the taxonomy of the genus.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was supported by a grant from the Tunisian Ministry of Higher Education, Scientific Research and Technology (LR15CBBC02) and by H2020-E.U.3.2-678781-MycoKey-Integrated and innovative key actions for mycotoxin management in the food end feed chain. Dr. Besma Sghaier-Hammami was supported by a project "Programme d'encouragement des jeunes chercheurs (19PEJC07-17)".

LITERATURE CITED

- Andersen B., Dongo A., Pryor B.M., 2008. Secondary metabolite profiling of Alternaria dauci, A.porri, A.solani and A. tomatophila. Mycological Research 112: 241–250.
- Andrew M., Peever T.L., Pryor B.M., 2009. An expanded multilocus phylogeny does not resolve morphological species within the small-spored *Alternaria* species complex. *Mycologia* 101: 95–109.
- Arcella D., Eskola M., Gómez Ruiz J.A., 2016. Dietary exposure assessment to *Alternaria* toxins in the European population. *EFSA Journal* 4654: 14.
- Barbour M., 1970. Seedling Ecology of *Cakile maritima* along the California Coast. *The Journal of the Torrey Botanical Society* 97: 280–289.
- Belisario A., Maccaroni M., Coramusi A., Corazza L., Figuli P., Pryor B.M., 2004. First report of *Alternaria* species groups involved in disease complexes of hazelnut and walnut fruit. *Plant Disease* 88: 404.
- Bensassi F., Zid M., Rhouma A., Bacha H., Hajlaoui M.R., 2009. First report of *Alternaria* species associated with black point of wheat in Tunisia. *Annals of Microbiology* 59: 465–467.
- Bensassi F., Chennaoui M., Bacha H., Hajlaoui M.R., 2011. Survey of the mycobiota of freshly harvested wheat grains in the main production areas of Tunisia. *African Journal of Food Science* 5: 292–298.
- Bensassi F., Gallerne C., El Dein O.S., Hajlaoui M.R., Bacha H., Lemaire C., 2012. Cell death induced by the Alternaria mycotoxin Alternariol. *Toxicology In Vitro* 26: 915–923.
- Berbee M.L., Pirseyedi M., Hubbard S., 1999. Cochliobolus phylogenetics and the origin of known, highly virulent pathogens, inferred from ITS and glyceraldehyde-3-phosphate dehydrogenase gene sequences. Mycologia 91: 964–977.
- Bock C.H., Thrall P.H., Burdon J.J., 2005. Genetic structure of populations of *Alternaria brassicicola* suggests the occurrence of sexual recombination. *Mycological Research* 109: 227–236.
- Brun S., Madrid H., Gerrits Van Den Ende B., Andersen B., Marinach-Patrice C., Mazier D., 2013. Multilocus phylogeny and MALDI-TOF analysis of the plant pathogenic species *Alternaria dauci* and relatives. *Fungal Biology* 117: 32–40.
- Canova C., Heinrich J., Anto J.M., Leynaert B., Smith M., ... Jarvis D., 2013. The influence of sensitisation to

pollens and moulds on seasonal variations in asthma attacks. *European Respiratory Journal* 42: 935–945.

- Chethana B.S., Ganeshan G., Rao A.S., Bellishree K., 2018. Morphological and Molecular Characterization of *Alternaria* Isolates Causing Purple Blotch Disease of Onion. *International Journal of Current Microbiology and Applied Sciences* 7: 3478–3493.
- Clausing G., Vickers K., Kadereit J.W., 2000. Historical biogeography in a linear system: genetic variation of Sea Rocket (*Cakile maritima*) and Sea Holly (*Eryngiummaritimum*) along European coasts. *Molecular Ecology* 9: 1823–1833.
- Da Cruz Cabrala L., Terminiello L., Pinto V.F., Fog K., Patriarca N.A., 2016. Natural occurrence of mycotoxins and toxigenic capacity of *Alternaria* strains from mouldy peppers. *International Journal of Food Microbiology* 7: 155–160.
- Debez A., Ben Hamed K., Grignon C., Abdelly C., 2004. Salinity effects on germination, growth, and seed production of the halophyte *Cakile maritima*. *Plant Soil* 262: 179–189.
- Debez A., Braun H.P., Pich A., Taamalli W., Koyro H.W., Abdelly C., Huchzermeyer B., 2012. Proteomic and physiological responses of the halophyte *Cakile maritima* to moderate salinity at the germinative and vegetative stages. *Journal of Proteomics* 75: 5667– 5694.
- Fehr M., Pahlke G., Fritz J., Christensen M.O., Boege F., Altemoller M., Podlech J., Marko D., 2009. Alternariol acts as a topoisomerase poison, preferentially affecting the IIa isoform. *Molecular Nutrition & Food Research* 53: 441–451.
- Hattab Z., Lasfar N.B., Abid M., Bellazreg F., Fathallah A., ... Letaief A., 2019. *Alternaria alternata* infection causing rhinosinusitis and orbital involvement in an immunocompetent patient. *New Microbes and New Infections* 100561: 2052–2975.
- Hewitt E.J., 1966. Sand and water culture methods used in the study of plant nutrition. 2nd Ed., East Malling: Commonwealth Agricultural Bureaux.
- Hong S.G., Cramer R.A., Lawrence C.B., Pryor B.M., 2005. Alt a1 allergen homologs from *Alternaria* and related taxa: Analysis of phylogenetic content and secondary structure. *Fungal Genetics and Biology* 42: 119–129.
- Hong S.G., Maccaroni M., Figuli P.J., Pryor B.M., Belisario A., 2006. Polyphasic classification of *Alternaria* isolated from hazelnut and walnut fruit in Europe. *Mycological Research* 110: 1290–1300.
- Kadereit J.W., Arafeh R., Somogyl G., Westberg E., 2005. Terrestrial growth and marine dispersal? Comparative phylogeography of five coastal plant species at a European scale. *Taxon* 54: 861–876.

- Kubiak-Martens L., 1999. The plant food component of the diet at the late Mesolithic (Ertebølle) settlement at TybrindVig, Denmark. *Veg. Hist. Archaeobot* 8: 117–127.
- Lauren J., Fadwa T., 2008 Factors Affecting Mycotoxin Production in Fruits. In: *Mycotoxins in Fruits and Vegetables* (R. Barkai-Golan, N. Paster, ed.), Academic Press, 75–104.
- Lawrence D.P., Gannibal P.B., Peever T.L., Pryor B.M., 2013. The sections of *Alternaria*: Formalizing species-group concepts. *Mycologia* 105: 530–546.
- Li N., Toyazaki T., Yoshizawa J., 2001. Production of Alternaria mycotoxins by *Alternaria alternata* isolated from weather-damaged wheat. *Journal of Food Protection* 64: 567–571.
- Linde C.C., Liles J.A., Thrall P.H., 2010. Expansion of Genetic Diversity in Randomly Mating Founder Populations of Alternaria brassicicola Infecting Cakile maritima in Australia. Applied Environmental Microbiology 76: 1946–1954.
- Liu G.T., Qian Y.Z., Zhang P., Dong W.H, Qi Y.M., Guo H.T., 1992. Etiological role of *Alternaria alternata* in human esophageal cancer. *Chinese Medical Journal* 105: 394–400.
- Logrieco A., Moretti A., Solfrizzo M., 2009. *Alternaria* toxins and plant diseases: An overview of origin, occurrence and risks. *World Mycotoxin Journal* 2: 129–140.
- Lou J., Fu L., Peng Y., Zhou L., 2013. Metabolites from *Alternaria* Fungi and Their Bioactivities. *Molecules* 18: 5891–5935.
- Moretti A., Pascale M., Logrieco A.F., 2019. Mycotoxin risks under a climate change scenario in Europe. *Trends in Food Science & Technology* 84: 38–40.
- Myresiotis C.K., Testempasis S., Vryzas Z., Karaoglanidis G.S., Mourkidou P.E., 2015. Determination of mycotoxins in pomegranate fruits and juices using a QuEChERS-based method. *Food Chemistry* 182: 81–88.
- Oliver E.J., Thrall P.H., Burdon J.J., Ash J.E., 2001. Vertical disease transmission in the *Cakile-Alternaria* host-pathogen interaction. *Australian Journal of Botany* 49: 561–569.
- Ostry V., 2008. Alternaria mycotoxins: An overview of chemical characterization, producers, toxicity, analysis and occurrence in foodstuffs. *World Mycotoxin Journal* 1: 175–188.
- Pastor F.J., Gaurro J., 2008. *Alternaria* infections: laboratory diagnosis and relevant clinical features. *Clinical Microbiology and Infection* 14: 737–746.
- Patriarca A., 2016. *Alternaria* in food products. *Current Opinion in Food Science* 11: 1–9.

- Pryor B.M., Michailides T., 2002. Morphological, Pathogenic, and Molecular Characterization of *Alternaria* Isolates Associated with *Alternaria* Late Blight of Pistachio. *Phytologia* 92: 406–416.
- Puntscher H., Kütt M.L., Skrinjar P., Mikula H., Podlech J., ... Warth B., 2018. Tracking emerging mycotoxins in food: development of an LC-MS/MS method for free and modified *Alternaria* toxins. *Analytical and Bioanalytical Chemistry* 410: 4481–4494.
- Ramires F.A., Masiello M., Somma S., Villani A., Susca A., ... Moretti A., 2018. Phylogeny and Mycotoxin Characterization of *Alternaria* Species Isolated from Wheat Grown in Tuscany, Italy. *Toxins* 10: 472.
- Roberts R.G., Reymond S.T., Andersen B., 2000. RAPD fragment pattern analysis and morpholigcal segregation of small-spored *Alternaria* species and species groups. *Mycological Research* 104: 151–160.
- Rubert J., Dzuman Z., Vaclavikova M., Zachariasova M., Soler C., Hajslova J., 2012. Analysis of mycotoxins in barley using ultra high liquid chromatography high resolution mass spectrometry: Comparison of efficiency and efficacy of different extraction procedures. *Talanta* 99: 712–719.
- Santiago I.F., Goncalves V.N., Gomez-Silva B., Galetovic A., Rosa L.H., 2018. Fungal diversity in the Atacama Desert. Antonie Van Leeuwenhoek 111: 1345–1360.
- Schiro G., Müller T., Verch G., Sommerfeld T., Mauch T., ... Müller M.E.H., 2018. The distribution of mycotoxins in a heterogeneous wheat field in relation to microclimate, fungal and bacterial abundance. *Journal of Applied Microbiology* 126: 177–190.
- Serdani M., Kang J.C., Andersen B., Crous P.W., 2002. Characterization of *Alternaria* species-group associated with core rot of apples in South-Africa. *Mycological Research* 106: 561–569.
- Simmons E.G., 1990. *Alternaria* themes and variations (17–53). *Mycotaxon* 37: 79–119.
- Simmons E.G., 2007. *Alternaria*: An Identification Manual, 6th ed.; CBS Fungal Biodiversity Centre: Utrecht, The Netherlands, 775 pp.
- Simmons E.G., Roberts R., 1993. *Alternaria* themes and variations (73). *Mycotaxon* 48: 109–140.
- Somma S., Amatulli M.T., Masiello M., Moretti A., Logrieco A.F., 2019. *Alternaria* species associated to wheat black point identified through a multilocus sequence approach. *International Journal of Food Microbiology* 293: 34–43.
- Steyn P.S., Rabie C.J., 1976. Characterization of magnesium and calcium tenuazonate from *Phoma sorghina*. *Phytochemistry* 15: 1977–1979.
- Stypuła-Trębas S., Minta M., Radko L., Jedziniak P., Posyniak A., 2017. Nonsteroidal mycotoxin alter-

nariol is a full androgen agonist in the yeast reporter androgen bioassay. *Environmental Toxicology and Pharmacology* 55: 208–211.

- Taheri P., 2019. Disease resistance and virulence screen in *Solanum tuberosum–Alternaria tenuissima* interaction: the role of pathogenicity factors. *Euphytica* 215: 15.
- Tamura K., Peterson D., Peterson N., Stecher G., Nei M., Kumar S., 2011. MEGA5: Molecular Evolutionary Genetics Analysis Using Maximum Likelihood, Evolutionary Distance, and Maximum Parsimony Methods. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* 28: 2731–2739.
- Thrall P.H., Andrew Y.G., Burdon J.J., 2000. An analysis of mating structure in populations of the annual sea rocket, *Cakile maritima* (Brassicaceae). *Australian Journal of Botany* 48: 731–738.
- Thrall P.H., Burdon J.J., Bock C.H.,2002. Short-term epidemic dynamics in the *Cakile maritima – Alternaria* brassicicola host-pathogen association. Journal of Ecology 89: 723–735.
- Thrall P.H., Barrett L.G., Burdon J.J., Alexander H.M., 2005. Variation in pathogen aggressiveness within a metapopulation of the *Cakile maritima-Alternaria* brassicicola host-pathogen association. Plant Pathology 4: 265–274.
- Wang W., Jones C., Ciacci-Zanella J., Holt T., Gilchrist D.G., Dickman M.B., 1996. Fumonisins and Alternaria alternata lycopersici toxins: Sphinganine analog mycotoxins induce apoptosis in monkey kidney cells. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 93: 3461–3465.
- Woudenberg J.H.C., Seidl M.F., Groenewald J.Z., De Vries M., Stielow J.B., ... Crous P.W., 2015. Alternaria section Alternaria: Species, formaespeciales or pathotypes? *Studies in Mycology* 82: 1–21.
- Zarrouk M., Elalmi H., Youssef N.B., Sleimi N., Smaoui A., ... Abdelly C., 2003. Lipid composition of local halophytes seeds: *Cakile maritima*, *Zygophyllum album* and *Crithmummaritimum*. In: *Crash crop halophytes: recent studies* (Lieth H, Mochtchenko M eds). Springer, Berlin, 121–126.